

This is Google's cache of <http://themagazineproject.com/2010/11/transwomen-are-merely-castrated-men/>. It is a snapshot of the page as it appeared on 22 Nov 2010 18:47:45 GMT. The [current page](#) could have changed in the meantime. [Learn more](#)

These terms only appear in links pointing to this page:

[http themagazineproject com 2010 11 transwomen are merely castrated men](#)

[Full version](#)

- [About](#)
- [Writers](#)

[The Magazine Project](#) An Open Space for LGBT Women

- [In the News](#)
- [Relationships](#)
 - [Work Politics](#)
 - [Love & Sex](#)
 - [Coming Out](#)
- [Reviews](#)
 - [Books](#)
 - [Technology](#)
 - [Events](#)
 - [Music](#)
- [Les Drôles Choses](#)
- [Lifestyle](#)
 - [Fashion](#)
 - [Childcare](#)
- [Feminism](#)
- [RSS Feed](#)

[“Transwomen” Are Merely Castrated Men](#)

By [Bev Jo](#)

– November 17, 2010 Posted in: [Feminism](#), [Love & Sex](#), [Relationships](#)

The following is the first chapter of my new book entitled “Defining Lesbians Out Of Existence”, which I will hopefully finish soon.

DEFINING LESBIANS OUT OF EXISTENCE

– The Pretenders –

Bev Jo

PART ONE: “Transwomen” Are Merely Castrated Men

Men want access to all women, and Lesbians are a favorite theme in male pornography. Men also envy us and our culture and our communities. Some will go to almost any length to get to us. One particularly

insidious form that this invasion takes is by some men claiming THEY are Lesbians. This would be laughable if it wasn't so serious, and if most Lesbians didn't seem to believe them.

Some castrated men simply lie, and claim to be "biological women" or "women-born-women." I believe most would try this if they weren't so obviously male, so the majority insist that they are "transwomen" or "Male-to-Female Transsexuals" and that they have just as much right to be in women-only and Lesbian space as real women and Lesbians. They even say that we oppress them! If we dare to fight to defend our rare, precious women-only space, we're accused needing education, and of being "ignorant" and "transphobic."

We're not stupid – some of us have been fighting these men for 40 years. And we're not "phobic" – we're not afraid of men claiming to be us, we're oppressed by them!

You can think about this issue in three ways:

1. You can just ignore men claiming to be Lesbians (which is possible only if you don't go to any Lesbian events and if you don't care about our community being destroyed).
2. You can choose to accept them when they insist they are Lesbians and women – but know that your choice is seriously hurting and demeaning all Lesbians and women.
3. You can refuse to have one more lie shoved down your throat and believe what should be obvious to everyone who's been around these incredibly arrogant men for any length of time (such as at just one "women only" event).

"Transwomen" are not and can never be women or Lesbians – they are simply men, trying to steal our identity and culture.

One way to begin to fight their oppressing Lesbians and women is to refuse to give them what they want. At the very least, stop calling them "women" in any form, and stop using female pronouns for them.

They bully, intimidate, and guilt trip. In a liberal attempt to not hurt their feelings, in spite of how glaringly male they are, too many women and Lesbians support them against the rest of us. It's the old patriarchal tradition of putting any male above all females.

How can any woman or Lesbian value herself and the rest of us so little that she thinks we are nothing more than the absence of a prick?

Or that the male medical profession, for whom this has become big business, can create females out of males? Another attempt at bullying with guilt is when castrated men claim they have a "birth defect." How could anyone be so cruel as to deny someone something based on such a thing? This ploy is oppressive to truly intersex people. But expect that more castrated men will falsely identify as intersex.

If castrated men really had some tiny amount of caring for women and Lesbians, they would recognize how much we need women-only and Lesbian-only space, and would never try to force themselves on us.

It's outrageous that Lesbians who don't know what our Lesbian Feminist communities were like, which means they have no understanding of their own history, call us "ignorant" for objecting to men being in our communities. It's classist and arrogant, as well as deeply self-hating. Lesbians' desire to protect "transsexuals" is also about how kind and loving Lesbians can be to anyone they think is suffering. Lesbians are involved in far larger numbers than our percentage of the population in organizations fighting for people and animals and forests and every cause imaginable. Of course these are important issues, but it's time for Lesbians to also fight for Lesbians.

Anyone who protests is told the anti-Feminist seemingly liberal (but actually reactionary) line that we have no right to not accept someone's definition of themselves. But can you imagine another oppressed group being so welcoming to their previous oppressor claiming to feel like (and therefore be) them?

Would Lesbians and women so readily agree with a European-descent man who demands to be accepted as being another race – a race he has power over and is in a position to oppress? And would he be accepted into that community and get into positions of power as a spokesman for that community? I would hope anyone with a heart and half a brain would object. But why accept a man claiming sex change is possible, if race change is obviously ridiculous and oppressive? Why then are women and Lesbians valued so little that most are flattered when men pretend to be us?

The damage castrated men cause is tremendous – they have destroyed or tried to destroy the very ways by which women try to protect and heal ourselves from male violence, such as Women's Centers, Battered Women's Shelters, and Rape Crisis Centers, internationally, as well as destroying the last remaining, rare, and precious spaces where we meet and socialize and create Lesbian community, such as the Michigan Women's Music Festival. If these men were really so female-minded and cared about women and girls, would they really sue so their male voice could be what a raped woman or girl has to hear when she calls a Rape Crisis line? (The suit was in Vancouver, British Columbia, Canada. But men are now regularly on Rape Crisis lines in the US.)

The sense of entitlement and arrogance of these men is glaring – they act like any other man who thinks he has the right of access to all women. It is all about them – they are selfish and self-obsessed, and don't care how they hurt Lesbians and women and our communities. They have no respect for us or our need and desire to have our own Feminist and Lesbian culture away from them. They are acting out of the same drive to mark territory that is in all men, and particularly obvious in rapists. What part of "no" don't they understand?

The usual comment I hear from their advocates (who are quick to betray any Lesbian who's been attacked by these men) is "Why would they go through so much if they weren't really women?" Well, men do a lot of bizarre things for sexual gratification, such as strangle themselves to have more exciting orgasms (sorry to be graphic, but, really, male-supporters need to know this), which has resulted in a lot of unintentional suicides (such as that by David Carradine.) Some do other painful and dangerous rituals, including having objects inserted into their heads to simulate horns, having their skin completely tattooed to look like green scales, and their tongue spit so that they appear a bit like reptiles (about as convincing as when men try to appear like women). Other men disable themselves by amputating limbs deliberately. Men don't always think about the consequences when they decide they want to do something bizarre or when they want to invade and mark territory.

It's not up to us to explain why they do what they do. It's like trying to explain why men and boys rape females, rape, torture, and kill animals, and, why, as soon as boys can stand, they start to throw rocks without caring who's in the way. They just don't make sense. (And they KNOW their desire for violence is part of how they are biologically different from us, in mind and body. Ironically, and tragically, it's Feminists who are the ones most often claiming that male violence is "socialization." For years, most Lesbian Feminists agreed with the mainstream media that males were not intrinsically evil, and that their misogyny was a result of socialization – "He raped and killed all those women because he was sexually abused in childhood." If that was the case, wouldn't most women be serial killers? Male animals aren't socialized to rape and kill, but they do. The evidence is there. Men know it. They know they are biologically different than females. Ask them if you doubt it. Even progressive Michael Moore admitted on Bill Maher's HBO show, "We want to fuck anything in front of us." It's only females who argue on male's behalf that we are all really the same. And no matter how nice a man seems, I always say, we never know what they're doing when alone with women, girls, animals or babies.)

In 1979, Janice Raymond published *The Transsexual Empire: The Making of the She-Male*, describing the harm castrated men do to Lesbian community. She says this actually has been going on for centuries, from when "eunuchs were men that other more powerful men used to keep their women in place." She also explains, "Because transsexuals have lost their physical "members" does not mean that they have lost their ability to penetrate women—women's mind, women's space, women's sexuality. Transsexuals merely cut off the most obvious means of invading women so that they seem noninvasive." Many Lesbians ask, "Well, what can they do without their pricks?" The answer is that they have been able to get into our community and culture much further than het men can, and they have done far more damage. They prevent us from having female-only space, which men have been trying to stop for a very long time. And, as Janice Raymond says, "All transsexuals rape women's bodies by reducing the real female form to an artifact, appropriating their body for themselves." It's actually reminiscent of the "Invasion of the Body Snatchers."

What is more upsetting is why so many Lesbians will attack other women on the behalf of these men. I believe it's on the continuum with the women who will love men, no matter what they've done, and who will chase and marry serial rapists and killers in prison. They are male-worshipping. And I believe that castrated men are far more male in their minds and behavior than even many men who are still full of testosterone. Most women, and sadly, too many Lesbians, will put males before other females, and certainly before other Lesbians.

I've been a Separatist since 1972, and so haven't been around men in social situations by choice very often. But since almost nothing for Lesbians is now women-only, I've been around some het men at Lesbian events in the last few years. One thing has become quite obvious to me – most het men at these events are far less aggressive, bullying, and sense-of-entitlement male than castrated men who claim to be Lesbians. And that's pretty bad, isn't it?

Misplaced Sympathy and Generosity

If I told you I was a bird, would you believe and accept me as one? Why not? Don't I have the right to self-identify and you have the obligation to respect that?

We would not have nearly as much trouble in dealing with these invasive castrated men if it wasn't for the many Lesbians who rush to support them against other Lesbians. It reminds me of how the US government could never have won in their invasion against the many nations of Indigenous people who fought them if there weren't collaborators, because the European-descent military just was not the equal of the Indians' wisdom and skill.

One of our greatest strengths as females and Lesbians is our ability to have open hearts and to want to care for and support anyone who claims to be vulnerable or needing help. It's also one of our greatest weaknesses. Rapists know this and use it to con victims. Serial rapist and killer Ted Bundy often pretended to have an injury to get access to women who otherwise would have been more wary.

If a man cries and says he always felt oppressed as a girl growing up and really wants/needs to be with us, most women accept him and begin to "educate" (bully) other women and Lesbians on his behalf. I understand this sympathy from Lesbians and women, but don't understand how they can then be so heartless and cruel to the Lesbians and women these men hurt — or how they don't notice the next moves this "transwoman" makes once in a Lesbian community, and how incredibly male and un-female-like he is. There is nothing female about castrated men. It's almost like women feel so sorry for them in their repulsive bodies and minds, with their very ugly rendition of what they think is a "feminine" womanly appearance, that they overlook their aggressive male behavior. One who I have known personally from before he claimed he always felt female (I was the first Lesbian he met), is simply lying

Castrated men have bizarre fetishized ideas of what it means to be female, based on an obsession with male-defined patriarchal rules of femininity and pornography. If you try to get them to really explain what being female means to them beyond revealing clothing, make-up, wanting to imitate models or movie stars, they really can't do it. Perhaps some eventually learn a few tricks, like the divorced father of several children who confided to me that it was the Lesbian teacher and students in a women's studies class in Aotearoa who taught him to give up his skirts, dresses, make-up, and high heels so he could look like a "real Dyke." (He also had his way paid to go to an Oakland Lesbian and Gay conference, which would have cost thousands, but there was no sliding scale or reduced rate from the \$200 charged poor Lesbians. Castrated men are not just accepted – they're given preferential treatment at our expense.)

Some have also learned what things to say to try to sound believably female, but if you question a bit further, they revert quickly to male bullying techniques.

One of the reasons these men want to get into Lesbian communities is that they are not very successful as typical het men. Many seem to be failures in getting access to women, and realize that not only are Lesbian communities an untapped source of exceptionally tolerant women — as well as a way to fulfill that male fantasy of Lesbians — but that they also can get into power positions they never would have been able to get into as just the nerdy men that they are. (The other type is the long-term married men with grown children who decide later in life that they are Lesbians. Many still keep their wives, and I know of at least one who got his employer to sign a statement guaranteeing that his higher male salary would not be reduced after he "transitioned.") Have they gotten bored with privilege or have they been watching too much "Lesbian"-themed porn?)

What Do You Call a Man Who Refuses to Take "No" for an Answer?

This issue is personal to me because I've been called a "bigot" by a "Feminist" friend for refusing use female pronouns for the man who sexually harassed me when I was a teenager. I've felt stalked by him for over 40 years, but I can't get away from him even in "women-only" space. I think it's outrageous that any woman or Lesbian should have to see a man who has harassed her in what should be safe space. (Please remember that all of these men have pasts, and assume many will have raped girls or women. They're MEN, after all.)

I also have a unique perspective when I say I believe many castrated men are lying.

In 1968, when I was 17, I met Elliott at USF. He had been in a Jesuit seminary high school and just could not understand why I wouldn't be his girlfriend. I found him repulsive and embarrassing, but felt sorry for him so we became friends. He just could not grasp why I was in love with Marg and not interested in him. He'd never thought of Lesbians before, and certainly did not feel he was a woman in a man's body. We were in a poetry group together and I remember clearly the poem he wrote that was completely about phallic symbols. Elliott was so proud of his adolescent male poem, and when I see him now, he still acts very similar except that he now claims he's a Lesbian.

This was before I'd seen any Feminist writing. The only Lesbian book I read was "The Well of Loneliness," in which the Lesbian character gives up her lover so she can find true happiness with a man. The only movies about Lesbians that I saw were "The Children's Hour," "The Fox," and "The Killing of Sister George," which all were incredibly stereotyped in their Lesbian-hatred and which had a horrible effect on Marg and me.

I could feel Elliott watching me as the months went by, and, if I seemed to begin to be friends with other men, he would go into a rage and cry. I transferred to a different school to try to be with Marg, but still stayed in touch with Elliott. He said he'd fallen in love with another Lesbian and that she'd made love to

him as if he were a woman. After a while, he decided he was a Lesbian and took "Beth" for his first name (as close to my name as he could get) and dyed his hair a similar red to mine. (Would that creep you out?) Almost immediately, this nerdy, pathetic man suddenly got into power positions in the Lesbian community. He was accepted into the Daughters of Bilitis (one of the first Lesbian organizations) and quickly became vice president, which caused a split leading to the end of the organization. He was invited to perform his "Lesbian" music at the LA Lesbian Feminist Conference in 1973 and now claims to be one of the originators of "Women's Music." He continued to get into every power position in our community that he could, lying whenever possible if asked if he were a "woman-born-woman" – which is what he told the Feminist "off our backs" newspaper collective when they questioned him before printing his long article titled "Lesbian Sex (where he described the many women who "loved" having sex with him. He became the regular "Lesbian" columnist for "The Bay Area Reporter," a local gay and Lesbian publication. Meanwhile, I would see his racist and self-centered letters in other gay publications. When I tried to counter one in which he compared Mexican immigrants to German Nazis ("Del Norte is Spanish for "Lebensraum"), he countered by slandering me in the worst way he could think of. I began telling Lesbians to be aware that when they read something oppressive or offensive by a "Lesbian." to consider that it might not actually be a Lesbian or even a woman who wrote it.

I didn't see Elliott for years, but then found out that he was regularly performing his "songs" at one of the only "women only" open mics in the Bay Area. He still played the guitar badly and bellowed out of tune songs about how angry he was that women wanted to "bed" him, but not "wed" him. (I haven't seen any signs of either happening.) I had no choice but to accept his presence if I wanted to participate in this part of the community. Then, an African-descent friend told me she had recently met Elliott through a friend and he was incredibly racist and patronizing to her. He also spouted right-wing politics, such as supporting McCarthy's Fifties boycott of Leftists like Pete Seeger and said that the police must have had good reason to have arrested her friend, Henry Louis Gates, at his own home. She felt threatened enough that she changed her phone number.

I ignored Elliott more at Lesbian events after hearing this, so he wrote a nasty email on a local Lesbian list ridiculing Separatists and Never-het Lesbians after we advertised a meeting. I responded by saying how he had harassed me as a teenager and how I can't escape him now, and got an angry response from his Lesbian supporters in my community. They accused me of "outing" him, even though he has finally admitted to being a "transwoman" on his website, and he became more bullying at the open mic. He bellowed a "song" ridiculing short hair on Lesbians, saying how he likes long hair on women (like most castrated men, he tries to look as feminine as possible. (Interesting that I've never yet seen a castrated man who looked remotely Butch.)

The next time, one of his friends smirked at me just before he did a "song" that was attacking me virtually by name, and did name my ex-lover, Martha. He accused me of stalking HIM and said I lied when I said I was a lifelong Lesbian because I had been in a ménage a trois with Martha and her boyfriend. I had hated her boyfriend because I would have to leave our bed when he came to fuck her (again, before Feminist support), and no, I was never with a male. I had no close friends with me that night and had to quickly decide what to do. When it was my turn to read poetry, I read defending myself, and discovered that Elliott had his support group of Lesbians ready, because as soon as I said "I don't like conflict, but I believe in self defense..." they got up and walked out. One stood up and kept yelling at me, correcting my use of male pronouns for him. The Lesbian who was in charge, as well as the owner of the space, banned us both from reading for the rest of the season. It didn't matter that he had attacked me and that I defended myself. I'm sure if it had been a physical attack, I still would have been punished for being impolite and for not "taking the higher road." (There was also obviously a cultural difference going on.) I did get a lot of support from friends who heard about it later — they were Separatists, Radical Lesbian Feminists, and completely unpolitical non-Feminist Lesbians and women. The one "friend" who criticized me is middle class, and most of my supporters are poverty class and working

class, so that was very interesting. (One sweetie even high-fived me and said "Congratulations, dude!" about having been banned.)

A few days later, I wrote Elliott, asking if he was deliberately lying about me or if he was confused. It was interesting to see exactly how he cons Lesbians. He began by threatening me that he would make more information about me public, so I asked what specifically that was, since there was nothing I was hiding. He didn't answer and then became insulting and ridiculing, saying that Separatism had failed and that I'd wasted my time while he'd been doing important work for Lesbians. I said we had an international movement that was doing just fine in spite of men like him and that he had done a lot of harm to Lesbians. So then he tried his usual line, about how he had felt like a girl growing up. I said that was a lie because he would have told me when we were friends, and reminded him about his phallic poem. He denied it as well as denying his racist letter (as a "Lesbian") to the Bay Times. He his denial like a lawyer would have, almost in legalese. When I told him I had copies of both, he really lost it and ranted. Finally, he tried pity, saying he was a "freak." He chose to do what he did. Many people who've had extreme plastic surgery later regret it – not that he's said that. He still has so much access to women and Lesbians that most men never get. And he has the pleasure of watching so many Lesbians fight over him, and attack other Lesbians on his behalf.

It was exhausting and horrible to be baited, taunted, and insulted, but I did get to tell him that he can never have what he and other castrated men are trying so hard to get — which is to have sex with a Lesbian — because once a woman is with them, she is no longer a Lesbian. And, of course, only the most self-hating of women would choose such men — which may be why I never see him involved with anyone. Even the most liberal mainstream-minded and/or self-hating Lesbians won't go that far.

It was interesting to me to notice that his primary supporters are all European-descent and mostly middle class, with some identified as Feminists. My friends in the community who don't identify as Feminists are much more repulsed by him and don't want to be around him. It seems that castrated men have so manipulated Feminist ideas that they get the more Feminist-identified to be their main supporters. Their support for those who are "queer" and don't fit into mainstream culture is misplaced. And they forget the Lesbians and women they are hurting.

Elliott is just one example that I can write about personally because of knowing him clearly before it ever entered his mind to identify as a Lesbian. Not many Lesbians can say they know for certain these men are simply lying. I don't see other castrated men acting any differently. At one Lesbian event, a castrated man reached out to smack a friend of mine on the butt as she walked by. She didn't know him and he felt that confident and arrogant. I have never seen a Lesbian do that. A friend who knows him says he's groped her and tried to kiss her whenever he has a chance. He has a wife who he married when he still identified as a man, and he told my friend that he hasn't told his wife how he likes to go out and pay undocumented workers to fuck him.

A neighbor became petulant when we didn't want to refer to him as a "mother" to his cat. He's a typical privileged blond divorced middle class man with two kids who plays music loud late into the night with his door and windows open. He's one of the most territorial and obviously male of our neighbors. But then he began swanning about the street at midnight in a flowing dress, changed his name to a female version, and has begun showing up at Lesbian events. I have yet to see anything female about any of these men.

I have friends in other countries who've seen identical patterns. One dear friend in Sweden wrote about how she counters charges of "transphobia:"

"The word phobia means 'irrational fear'. My fear of MTF transsexuals is not irrational — it's well-

founded and justified. That fear is political (they destroy lesbian feminist politics and community) and physical (like other men they are physically violent and can be sexually abusive and intimidating). I also have a feminist critique of them and the transsexual movement (a conservative, anti-feminist movement). Having a lesbian feminist analysis and critique of castrated men and their movement is not the same being "phobic".

Another proof of the right wing, anti-Lesbian and gay aspect of "transsexualism" is that in fundamentalist Iran, where Lesbians and gay men are executed, the government pays for transsexual surgeries.

A disturbing trend is that in countries where castrated men are accepted as women, they're raising the statistics on inter-Lesbian abuse.

Recently, a friend started a thread on Facebook about the harm femininity does to females. Of course a man (who calls himself "Sarah)," had to intrude to lecture us that "Some women have penises." As I referred to "castrated men," he continued to "educate" me that eunuchs are not the same as "transwomen," and he kept interjecting the word "penis" into this Feminist discussion. Again, it would be almost laughable if it wasn't for the harm these men do. This is the same mentality behind groups of men sneaking into the Michigan Womyn's Music Festival and then running to the showers to take off their clothes and expose their pricks to women and girls. Again, what do you call a man who refuses to take "No" for an answer?"

If you love Lesbians and women, please do not participate in defining us out of existence. Please don't support castrated men against us in any way, including letting yourself be bullied into using our female names or pronouns for them. Know that whenever you don't object to these men, you're participating in making the space or event not safe for Lesbians and women, on behalf of men.

Bev Jo

Endnotes:

1. I first wrote about castrated men invading our communities in "Dykes and Gorgons," in 1973. Part of that was reprinted as our Gutter Dyke collective writings in the Separatists anthology, "For Lesbians Only," edited by Julia Penelope and Sarah Hoagland.

2. Janice Raymond's "The Transsexual Empire" is still an excellent resource about castrated men. It's criticized as "old information," but since it's true, it's a classic, Castrated men and their supporters hate it of course.

3. Sheila Jeffries has also written excellent books referring to castrated men. "Unpacking Queer Politics" has great support for Lesbians.

4. Information about Iran's support of sex change came from a BBC News story by Vanessa Barford — "Iran's Diagnosed Transsexuals" — and "Transsexual in Iran," from the original film, "Be Like Others," directed by Tanaz Eshaghian, and broadcast on BBC television in 2008.

Below is an excerpt from the article:

"Homosexual relationships are banned in Iran, but the country allows sex change operations and hundreds of men have elected for surgery to change their lives."

"Diagnosed transsexuals"

“Sex changes have been legal in Iran since Ayatollah Khomeini, the spiritual leader of the 1979 Islamic revolution, passed a fatwa – a religious edict – authorising them for “diagnosed transsexuals” 25 years ago.

Today, Iran carries out more sex change operations than any other nation in the world except for Thailand.

The government even provides up to half the cost for those needing financial assistance and a sex change is recognised on your birth certificate.

‘Islam has a cure for people suffering from this problem. If they want to change their gender, the path is open,’ says Hojatol Islam Muhammad Mehdi Kariminia, the religious cleric responsible for gender reassignment.

He says an operation is no more a sin than ‘changing wheat to flour to bread,’

Yet homosexuality is still punishable by death.

‘The discussion is fundamentally separate from a discussion regarding homosexuals. Absolutely not related. Homosexuals are doing something unnatural and against religion,’ says Kariminia. ‘It is clearly stated in our Islamic law that such behaviour is not allowed because it disrupts the social order.’”

7 Like

6 Comments

1. [Reply](#)

[Valerie M](#)

Posted November 17, 2010 at 3:29 AM

Although it’s called *L*GBT, I can’t remember the last time I saw something so supportive of Lesbians or women in general. I wish more women would realize that everything besides the *L* is steeped phallocentrism. Thanks so much for this, Bev Jo!

2. [Reply](#)

Kathy

Posted November 17, 2010 at 9:39 AM

“A man who refuses to take ‘no’ for an answer?” A useful way to look at this issue.

I find strength in this article–the strength to think about male incursions into our places as something I don’t have to tolerate without protest. In fact, protest becomes a necessity, for me, after reading this.

3. [Reply](#)

Linda Radfem

Posted November 19, 2010 at 10:32 PM

Thank you very much for this, Bev Jo. A fascinating and empowering read. Mind if I link?

4. [Reply](#)

Deb

Posted November 21, 2010 at 6:03 PM

Good job with this article, and with exposing Beth Elliot. That guys has been around the bay area for a very long time and even wrote a column in the Oakland lesbian newsletter "Telewoman." Probably the old separatists in Oakland remember that publication.

The thing that bugs me is why lesbians aren't 100% in favor of lesbians? Why do lesbians side with castrated men and not lesbians? Why did lesbians work on AIDS organizations when lesbians did not get AIDS? Why is the bulk of money going through a lot of so-called LGBT groups NOT going directly to lesbian only groups?

Why do lesbians allow castrated men in our spaces ever?

I think I have a few answers. First of all, lesbians tend to be in a constant state of rebellion all the time. It means every new generation of lesbians becomes very hostile to the old generation.

Everything lesbians fought for in terms of separatist culture, feminism, womyn only etc. To be continued

5. [Reply](#)

Deb

Posted November 21, 2010 at 6:12 PM

I recall that young "feminist" lesbians were very hostile to the old butch / femme bars, and the 1950s era working class butch/femme bar culture, and those women felt completely marginalized and dissed. They'd all had run ins with the police, faced bar raids, mafia, and just creating dyke culture during the very oppressive 50s, and the thanks they got? Dissed, pushed out by the more "radical" lesbian feminists, all of whom were in their early 20s at the time. We had a few token old ones like Dell and Phyllis, but D and P weren't separatists really.

So that's a constant in lesbian worlds. We have lesbians now forming over 50 groups, and over 60 groups only, just because of this. Go to an over 50 lesbian event and there are NO castrated men there! That's right NONE. Dykes of that era are solid separatists– the Alix Dobkin types, the old michigan festies...

Young lesbians are not reading or even caring about their elders... just don't give a damn. I have young lesbian friends and i cannot get them to read anything. They're all very pro trannie now, very hip, very Judith "Jack" Halberstamish transbutch "cool." Castrated men are almost always on lesbian panel discussions these days, spewing anti-radical lesbian attacks. It's subtle but it's out there. Young dykes just eat up their crap, and believe their nonsense.

So clearly we have this huge generational divide that has always been problematic in lesbian communities, and we still are getting zapped by it...because the culture hates old women, and hates old dykes, and just wants to transition. We don't have massive support for butch dykes, and so they transition, maybe because they get dissed in the lesbian community.

Just a few theories to toss out there– any other ideas?

o [Reply](#)

[Bev Jo](#)

Posted November 22, 2010 at 12:14 AM

Hi Deb,

In our book, "Dykes-Loving-Dykes," we go into detail as to why Lesbians support everyone but Lesbians. It is so upsetting and frustrating.

Sadly, it's the over 50 crowd who are Elliott's primary supporters. He goes to Third Thursday at Montclair, which is primarily older Lesbians. He's a member of WOFF — Women Over Fifty and Friends — which is a Lesbian group. At another open mic, with primarily over 50, there is another castrated man welcome to perform which leaves less time for the Lesbians.

So no, the over 50s are not my main support (I'm 60.) I feel the LEAST safe in the over 50's crowd. Especially if they define themselves as "Feminists. "No "solid Separatists" there at all. I'm curious if you're in the Bay Area and if we know each other and if you know of Separatists that I don't.

Alix Dobkin stopped being a Separatist years ago. I've been one longer than anyone else I know — since 1972.

I feel safer with younger Lesbians who know my Separatist past and respect me for it. I don't feel a generational divide at all. One of my closest Separatist friends, who is my blood (as a fellow lifelong Lesbian) is 26. I know other Separatists in their twenties, and other dear friends in their thirties, forties, and late sixties. I also have other Separatist friends across the world, but not many here — or, I should say, not many also into sado-masochism.

But yes, the Lesbian-hating propaganda is out there. Part 2 will be on FTMs. I say that most are actually Fem. There are a few Butches, but not the majority.

In this area, I'd felt that the new Lesbian Feminists were fairly respectful of bar Butches. This community in the Seventies was started partly by those Butches, such as Judy Grahn, Pat Parker, and others. Yes, role-playing was criticized, but I agree with that. You're right that Phyllis and Del were never Separatist, but Del did write a great article about gay men's female-hating.

Leave a Reply

Your email address will not be published. Required fields are marked *

Name *

Email *

Website

Comment

You may use these HTML tags and attributes: <abbr title=""> <acronym title=""> <blockquote cite=""> <cite> <code> <del datetime=""> <i> <q cite=""> <strike>

Powered by [WP Hashcash](#)

Wordpress Hashcash needs javascript to work, but your browser has javascript disabled. Your comment will be placed in moderation!

- **The Magazine Project**

- [About](#)
- [Writers](#)

- **Community**

We love comments on our articles!

The Magazine Project (TMP) is community-oriented. We rely on our viewers to guide us on what material should be discussed.

Please send feedback and submissions to community@themagazineproject.com.

- **About You**

What would you like to see more of at TMP?

- Advice
- Childcare
- Fashion
- (Longer) Features
- Feminism
- Lists
- Reviews
- Sex & Relationships

[View Results](#)

Loading ... Loading ...

- **Most ♥ Posts**

- [The Great Lesbian Divide](#) (9)
- ["Transwomen" Are Merely Castrated Men](#) (7)
- [Coming Out to Chinese Mothers](#) (5)
- [The Rock](#) (5)
- [Out at the Office](#) (4)

- **Recent Posts**

- [Zero-Sum Game: Flirting With Power](#)
- ["Transwomen" Are Merely Castrated Men](#)
- [8 Ways To Tell If She Is A Lesbian](#)
- [Children Of 2 Mommies Fare Better](#)
- [The Raveonettes Asian Tour](#)

- **Recent Comments**

- [j canaccord](#) on [The Great Lesbian Divide](#)
- [levitra bestellen](#) on [The Great Lesbian Divide](#)

- [Bev Jo](#) on [The Great Lesbian Divide](#)
- [Bev Jo](#) on ["Transwomen" Are Merely Castrated Men](#)
- [Deb](#) on ["Transwomen" Are Merely Castrated Men](#)

- **Archives**

- [November 2010](#) (8)
- [October 2010](#) (9)
- [September 2010](#) (6)

- **Tag Cloud**

[bisexuality](#) [butch](#) [chinese lesbians](#) [chinese mothers](#) [ex het](#) [femme](#) [heartbreak](#) [het male](#)
[stupidity](#) [how to](#) [human rights](#) [lesbian men](#) [lesbian moms](#) [never het](#) [out on bay street](#) [separatism](#) [trans](#)

- **Other Interesting Reads**

[30,000 Leave Church in Finland over Gay Rights -- A lesson in homophobia](#) | [Anti-gay church, grieving father square off over free speech, privacy](#) | [Gray, gay, and worried](#) | [Is a rented friend a real friend?](#) | [Lebanese poet Haddad pushes boundaries on erotica](#) | [Pregnant nun ice cream advert banned for 'mockery'](#) | [Say "Ni Hao" To The 20 Richest Self-Made Women In The World](#) | [Suicides put light on pressures of gay teenagers](#) | [Why indiscretions appear youthful](#) |

[Powered by J Canaccord](#)

Copyright 2010, The Magazine Project | An Open Space for LGBT Women. All Rights Reserved.

[web analytics](#)